

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins opened the Public Hearing at 7:00 p.m.

The Town Clerk called the roll.

Town Board Members Present

Tom Cumm Councilman
 Bob Prendergast Councilman
 Gina LeClair Councilwoman
 Todd Kusnierz Councilman
 Preston Jenkins Supervisor

Town Board Members Absent

None

Also Present: Jeanne Fleury, Town Clerk; Fran Thibodeau, Senior Account Clerk; Village Residents: Harry G. Gutheil, Jr., Margaret Centerbar, Debbie Fitzgibbon, Danny Shannon; Town Residents: Donna Prout, Adele Kurtz, Reed Antis, Nick Smith, Robert J. Vittengl, Jr., Town Resident and Member of the Town Recreation Commission; Chris Abrams, Highway Department Laborer and Town Resident; Andre Delvaux, Village Resident & Chief Operations Officer of the Moreau Emergency Squad; Steven M. VanGuilder, President/CEO of the Moreau Emergency Squad; and Larry Bulman, Property Owner/Tax Payer in the Town of Moreau

Supervisor Jenkins welcomed everyone to the Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Budget.

Supervisor Jenkins read the following information:

	2012	2011	Increase (Decrease)	Percent Change
Appropriations General Fund	2,623,071	2,625,041	(1,970)	-0.08%
Town/Outside Village	284,349	277,891	6,458	2.32%
Highway	2,103,338	2,221,860	(118,522)	-5.33%
Library	680,143	659,320	20,823	3.16%
Fire Protection	430,700	422,257	8,443	2.00%
General Fund Tax Levy	813,249	745,000	68,249	9.16%
Tax Rate	0.624111	0.590474	0.033637	5.70%
Tax Increase Household 200,000			6.73	
Town Outside Village	0	0	0	0
Highway	0	0	0	0
Library Tax Levy	680,143	659,320	20,823	3.16%
Tax Rate	0.511262	0.486768	0.024494	5.03%
Tax Increase Household 200,000			4.90	
Fire Protection Tax Levy	430,700	422,257	8,443	
Tax Rate	0.407015	0.390772	0.016243	
Tax Increase Household 200,000			3.25	
Appropriations All Funds	7,015,470	7,108,616	(93,146)	

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins referred to another spreadsheet that showed the tax cap calculations using the State Comptrollers formulas. He read from the spreadsheet the following information:

Tax Levy for 2012	\$745,000
Pension Increase Credit Adjustment	\$ 5,172
Tax Base Growth Factor	2.85%
Pilot Payments	\$ 26,000
Our Tax Cap	\$813,249

He stated that the Highway Fund Levy is at 2%.

Harry Gutheil asked what the General Fund balance was going to be at the end of 2011 and Supervisor Jenkins replied about \$3 million.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that this plan is sustainable.

He provided information on projected sales tax figures and said that in 2012 sales tax revenue is projected at \$2,612,000.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that he was happy that Supervisor Jenkins provided all this information. He said he just received the summary at 11:00 a.m. this morning. He asked where they were at with the water department employee. He asked if they were budgeting for a full-time employee or part-time.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that there are enough funds for a full-time person if they start in the last half of this year. Right now we still have two part-time people available.

Councilman Kusnierz asked Supervisor Jenkins if he has a projection on what will be left in the fund balance at the end of the five year plan, based on the form that was submitted to the State Comptroller for the amount of fund balance that would be utilized over the five year period.

Supervisor Jenkins replied about \$600,000. He said the goal would be to not use it quite that fast. In the calculations it does start phasing it down and that is an indication of where we are with the tax cap, we won't have a lot of opportunity to go beyond those numbers. It keeps the budget pretty stable for a five year period.

Councilman Kusnierz noticed that the projected revenues for the Moreau Emergency Squad, as reported in the newspaper, that the service payment was reduced from \$430,395 which are the numbers in the budget.

Supervisor Jenkins said that was incorrect information. That was just the insurance money that they were quoting.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if wasn't the Town funding the squad at \$395,000.

Supervisor Jenkins said that was correct. The reporter's question was what was the reduction in revenues? The reduction in revenues is estimated at what the reduction in the insurance money will be. We don't know what that figure will be. The current figure is \$395,000. It doesn't have an ultimate affect in taxes.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilman Kusnierz said there is some confusion out there and he asked how much the Town Board is providing to the squad?

Supervisor Jenkins replied that right now the budget shows \$231,000.

Larry Bulman owner of property at 13 Spruce Street asked how much the Fire Department was being funded.

Supervisor Jenkins replied \$430,700.

Harry Gutheil asked how much the pass through money is from the Moreau Emergency Squad year-to-date.

Supervisor Jenkins said the projected number is \$395,000 based on what has been received monthly.

Adele Kurtz asked what the \$31,000 was for in the contractual portion of B8010 Zoning.

Supervisor Jenkins said it is a combination of many things. It is fees paid out and the cost to update the Zoning Law.

Adele Kurtz asked if all of the \$31,000 that was budgeted for 2011 was spent.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that about \$13,000 to \$14,000 was spent.

Fran Thibodeau stated that \$4,700 has been spent to-date.

Adele Kurtz stated that back in 2008 or 2009 we spent about \$30,000 to have the LA Group put together zoning updates and we haven't received a finished project from them, but we keep budgeting \$30,000 for this. She wondered if there is a time frame for them to complete it.

Supervisor Jenkins said it was not the LA Group, it was Chazen. Chazen is waiting for information from us. "Departmentalized" Chazen isn't happy with the way they have handled it either, but we have our own share of the responsibility too.

Adele Kurtz asked if they were paid in full and have they completed their contractual end of it.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that they haven't completed it and he thought there was some money left in the budget for this purpose.

Harry Gutheil asked how much has been spent to-date on the rezoning and how much of the \$31,000 is earmarked for the rezoning. How much do we have left to spend to complete the task?

Supervisor Jenkins said he didn't have the answers. He said that a person has been hired to rewrite the zoning law and do some updating. At this point he wasn't sure if the Town was going to continue to utilize Chazen or not.

Harry Gutheil asked how much their contract was for.

Supervisor Jenkins said it goes back three years so he didn't know.

Councilman Kusnierz thought it was around \$28,000.

Harry Gutheil said \$28,000 and now we are budgeting another \$20,000.00 on top of it for the same task.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins said he would have to talk to Joe Patricke about this and get back to him.

Larry Bulman stated that the Moreau Emergency Squad provides an essential service to the Town and they do a great job as the Fire Company does. When he was on the Town Board, he learned a lot from Harry Gutheil about budgeting that he uses in his new position, but the Town Board at that time made the emergency services hold the line. He read all the articles and he is glad he waited until after the election. Just before he left the Town Board in 2000, the Town was funding the Moreau Emergency Squad in the amount of \$170,000 and now we are up to \$231,000. He said the economy was bad in 2000 and 2001, but the economy turned really sour in 2006 or 2007. He looked back in the minutes when the EMS went to a paid status and started billing the insurance companies. He supported that move. The budgeted amount has really gotten carried away and he would like to see the board go back to where they were in 2006. When they went to the paid status and started billing the insurance companies the squad stated that the good thing about this move was that they wouldn't have to come back and seek additional funds going forward. He said it was in the minutes. He thought the amount back then was \$195,000. He would like the board members to take a look at that number. He read in the newspaper and he knows that people already said there were misquotes, so he doesn't know what is true and what is not, but to do upkeep to the roads has gotten very expensive since he left. It was always a tough thing to debate, what roads to do, because there is only so much money and we want to keep our roads up-to-date. It was decided that the Town couldn't purchase a grader and a plow truck and the Town would have to postpone doing certain road repairs until 2013. When other departments are taking these types of cuts then the board needs to take a look at the EMS budget. He also heard about the two chase vehicles they purchased this year and he realizes that they probably took out a loan on them so they wouldn't have to pay for them all at once in cash, but then maybe they did he wasn't sure. If we are just giving this money to the Fire Department or Moreau Emergency Squad and they are out there buying this equipment that is really not necessary, but we are putting a hold on fixing our roads and not buying plows and graders then we aren't being fair with all of our departments. If we are going to continue to fund the EMS and Fire Department then we need to look at them as a department of the Town and everyone has to feel the pain. He thanked the board for their time.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that when Mr. Bulman was on the board the Moreau EMS did not provide the same level of advanced care. When the previous board did agree to move forward and allow insurance billings the reason they were in agreement to let them do this was because our residents of our community would receive a higher level of advanced emergency critical care right at their doorstep as opposed to having it come in from outside the area. We aren't comparing apples to apples if you compare one era when he had a certain amount budgeted for it versus the level of care we provide today. He agreed that the amount has increased, but you have to take that into consideration when you are considering how much the Town is earmarking for emergency services. As far as holding the line on emergency services, we did this with all of our not-for-profit organizations; we only allowed a 2% increase across the board for the Fire Company, Moreau Emergency Squad and the Moreau Community Center so he thought that the board was holding the line on expenses.

Larry Bulman stated that he has lived here for 45 years and he thinks the Moreau Emergency Squad has always provided a good level of service right through the 70's, 80's, 90's and today.

Councilman Kusnierz reiterated about the difference in care between then and now.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that when the board held their budget workshop with the Moreau Emergency Squad representatives of the squad discussed the squad's equipment account and equipment replacement fund and Councilman Prendergast mentioned that the balance was quite low and how an ambulance would have to be purchased in about two years. He asked Steve VanGuilder why he didn't mention at that time that they had purchased the two vehicles prior to that meeting and the debt they incurred. He said it was never mentioned.

Steve VanGuilder said there is no debt to the Town for those two vehicles.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins said he wasn't talking about the Town. He was talking about the squad.

Steve VanGuilder said there is not debt to the squad.

Supervisor Jenkins said not according to the bank.

Steve VanGuilder said the bill gets paid.

Supervisor Jenkins said he wasn't questioning whether the bill gets paid or not. When the board discussed the squad's debt situation and where they were headed in the future the vehicles had already been purchased and no one mentioned them. He said there were three members of the squad present and he assumes that all three of them knew about these vehicles.

Steve VanGuilder replied that the whole board knows about them.

Supervisor Jenkins asked Steve VanGuilder why he didn't say anything. The board was asking the squad about any debt they had and no one from the squad mentioned any new debt.

Steve VanGuilder said he didn't realize it was an issue, because it isn't a debt to the Town or the emergency squad.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if it was paid in cash or how was it paid for.

Steve VanGuilder said it is being paid, it is paid every month.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if it isn't paid by the squad and it isn't paid by the Town then how is it paid.

Steve VanGuilder replied it is paid by agreement.

Councilwoman LeClair asked by whom.

Steve VanGuilder said "we" own it.

Councilwoman LeClair asked who "we" is.

Steve VanGuilder replied the squad.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if the squad isn't paying for it and the Town isn't paying for it, then who is.

Steve VanGuilder replied "that would be Andre and Mike".

Councilwoman LeClair asked "out of their pocket".

Steve VanGuilder said that is correct.

Councilwoman LeClair asked "they are paying for these vehicles?"

Steve VanGuilder said "that is correct".

Councilwoman LeClair asked if it was a donation.

Steve VanGuilder said "a donation?"

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if the vehicles are owned by the squad.

Steve VanGuilder replied yes.

Councilwoman LeClair stated that if the vehicles are owned by the squad and the two people who are driving the vehicles are paying for the vehicles then is that not a donation?

Steve VanGuilder said no.

Councilwoman LeClair asked Steve VanGuilder to explain the situation to her then.

Steve VanGuilder said he didn't understand what she was looking for or what she wants.

Councilwoman LeClair asked who owns the vehicles.

Steve VanGuilder said again that the squad owns the vehicles and they are in the squad's name.

Councilwoman LeClair asked who took on the responsibility of the debt, who signed the note at the bank?

Steve VanGuilder said the squad did the board of directors.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if they signed the note.

Steve VanGuilder said "right".

Councilwoman LeClair asked if there are two members who are paying for the vehicles they drive.

Steve VanGuilder said this was right.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if they are giving a contribution.

Steve VanGuilder replied "they pay it".

Councilwoman LeClair asked if they had a contract with them to do that.

Steve VanGuilder said yes they do.

Councilwoman LeClair why are they paying that?

Councilman Kusnierz asked if he could interrupt and asked if they were proposing to change the amount of money budgeted for the squad.

Councilwoman LeClair said they hadn't gotten that far.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if that was the intent or were they going off on a tangent.

Councilwoman LeClair said she was curious about what was happening here.

Councilwoman LeClair recapped that there are two vehicles owned by the squad that are paid by the two members who drive the vehicles. When those vehicles are paid for who owns the vehicles.

Steve VanGuilder replied the squad does, but they have the option to buy them.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilwoman LeClair asked for how much.

Steve VanGuilder replied "whatever, when it is done paying for it". He said he would have to read the contract.

Councilman Cumm said they are paying the car payments and when the cars are paid off they are going to purchase them again.

Steve VanGuilder replied they have the option to purchase it as per the contract.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if this was something the board of directors worked out and agreed to.

Steve VanGuilder said yes along with their attorney.

Councilman Cumm asked if he was missing something here.

Councilwoman LeClair said she was and it sounds like a lease to her.

Steve VanGuilder said it is not a lease. He would have to have the contract in front of him.

Councilwoman LeClair stated that before she could make a decision she needed to see the contract.

Councilman Kusnierz said he had no problem if they wanted to keep the public hearing open, but he wanted to move on and look at other areas of the budget as well. He was very concerned that they were subjecting their taxpayers to a 5.7% tax increase at a period of time when the legislature and the governor came to an agreement to establish a 2% tax cap. He said that if they read the newspaper this week they could see that the Town of Moreau is exceeding that 2% tax cap through various means.

Supervisor Jenkins stated this wasn't true. He said if they looked at the schedule he gave everyone the calculation was done by the State Comptroller not him.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if there was more misinformation in the article.

Supervisor Jenkins said he was talking about the sheet he gave him, which shows him how to calculate the tax cap.

Councilman Cumm stated that every city, every municipality, in the state filled out exactly the same form and turned it into the State Comptroller's using that formula.

Councilman Kusnierz said he knows how the formula works.

Supervisor Jenkins said first of all there is the \$26,000 Pilot.

Councilman Kusnierz said he realizes that and that amount is taken off the top and you don't have to count that into the factor for the 2% tax.

Supervisor Jenkins said they are treating it as an equivalent to tax for the prior year.

Councilman Kusnierz said he knows that.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that we have a growth factor of 2.85%. We have a little bit of credit from pensions.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilman Kusnierz said he wasn't debating that under the State Comptroller's formula that we are not adhering to the 2%, but in dollars and cents it does exceed the 2%.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that if he looked at the figures the increase in the general fund is \$68,249. The only other thing on the sheet that we are responsible for is fire protection at \$8,443 for a total of \$77,000. He added that this board made a decision to send \$400,000 in sales tax revenue back to the county rather than \$200,000. If you add those three things together then there is really a tax decrease rather than an increase.

Councilman Kusnierz said it is a decrease in taxes as opposed to last year. That is a slice in time. From 2003 to 2008 we used to send every year to the county \$800,000 in sales tax revenue to maintain a reduced tax liability from the county standpoint on our residents. A new board came in and made different decisions and we whittled that down to \$200,000 not all of us, but collectively as a whole. He said on the record that he was "very happy" and that he fought the year before to get it up to \$416,000. He said it is very important.

Councilman Cumm asked if they knocked the \$200,000 off, what would that do to the tax rate this year.

Supervisor Jenkins said he didn't know without doing the math.

Councilman Cumm asked if wouldn't it eliminate the 2% completely and Supervisor Jenkins replied no, we are collecting \$813,000. It would lower the rate by 25%, which means the rate would go from \$.62 to \$.48.

Harry Gutheil stated that all they were doing was passing the burden to make it look like we are doing well with the tax base, but the county rate is going up. It is a shell game.

Supervisor Jenkins said we also got half a million dollars in sales tax money from the county this year.

Harry Gutheil stated that they should look at the total levy and see how much more the Town paid to the County.

Supervisor Jenkins said he did the math and we come out way ahead with the sales tax over the increase in tax. He said they also cut the county rate by 60% from the time Harry Gutheil left office.

Councilman Kusnierz said the "tax rate". He said the rate doesn't mean anything. It is how much we require our taxpayers to pay in tax dollars.

Larry Bulman stated we were forgoing over \$200,000 in this Town, because our assessed valuations were lower than they should have been. When this board voted to do a reval, which was a difficult vote he understands, it was the right thing to do. If you look at the numbers you will realize that we are receiving better than \$200,000 a year because of the board's actions.

Councilman Kusnierz said he was happy that Larry Bulman pointed that out, because it is a very important factor and it is one benefit of the reval. Our taxpayers didn't benefit from it. Their taxes didn't go down because we got \$200,000 more in sales tax revenue.

Larry Bulman replied that they benefitted from it because we got rid of the inequities in the Town. He owns 10 acres of land down at the corner of Hatchery Road and Selfridge Road and he was paying \$71.00 in total taxes when he owned it. It was assessed at \$7,000 and he sold it for \$70,000. He asked Councilman Kusnierz if he thought he was paying his fair share when he was paying \$71.00 total for Town & County and School Taxes on that property. He doesn't think so.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if it was classified as agricultural property and Larry Bulman replied no, vacant land.

Larry Bulman stated that he wasn't paying his fair share and all the people who owned land weren't either.

Councilman Kusnierz said that is an absolutely false statement.

Larry Bulman replied not everyone. He said there were inequities in the Town.

Councilman Kusnierz said there are inequities now. We just spent ½ million dollars plus on a reval and there are people here who will tell you that their property taxes went through the roof and they can't sell it today for what it is assessed at.

Larry Bulman asked Councilman Kusnierz if he was still saying that the reval was the wrong thing to do.

Councilman Kusnierz said he was saying that it wasn't done the way it could have been. It could have been done a lot cheaper and been more equitable.

Larry Bulman stated that he knows it had to be done and it should have been done 15 years ago and he is glad it was done.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that all he was saying is that if he was going to make the argument that the \$200,000 in increased sales tax revenue as the result of the formula changing with our increased assessments is benefitting the taxpayers, their taxes didn't go down. We are raising more revenue than ever.

Supervisor Jenkins asked Councilman Kusnierz how much revenue we raised in 2008. How much was the general fund tax levy.

Councilman Kusnierz said he didn't know.

Supervisor Jenkins replied \$1.6 million dollars. We had the same tax levy for four budgets we prepared. We will be collecting \$2.4 million in taxes from our citizens. To say we haven't lowered the taxes isn't true.

Harry Gutheil said they raised the county tax. He said that before the Town Board was putting \$300,000 away in fund balance to purchase the hydros and now you look at what the hydros are paying in taxes compared to before. He said for the board to look at the papermill's assessment, it went from \$30 million down to \$20 million +/- . The cement company went from \$5 million down to about \$2.25 million. Tentatively they came in with less than one million dollars in value on the quarry. He doesn't think we got the job we paid for and it wasn't monitored the way it should have been. He thinks we traded one set of inequities for another set. The sales are showing that.

Councilman Prendergast said it is tough times. We cut out a lot of things out of the budget that we would like to see and we cut out things last year in the budget and the year before. There are a lot of concerns out there that are eventually going to catch up with us. It is the consensus of this board that we don't want to hurt the people in the Town tax wise and we don't want to raise taxes. It is a battle going through these budgets. Nothing is easy. One thing that Supervisor Jenkins did was to try and give everybody an outlook as to what it is going to look like five years from now and that gives us something to work towards. He stated that some of these issues we have already gone through, we are here for the budget. We need to stick with the budget and try to get through it. We put in the paper that we were going to discuss the budget.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins said he wanted to discuss the highway budget. We are \$118,000 under last year. In this current budget we show that we picked up \$2,450,000 in sales tax revenues. The recent report shows that we will receive \$2.6 million in sales tax revenues and in 2012 it is projected at \$2,640,000. He would like to add \$100,000 to the highway equipment line item of the budget for the new building that we will probably need.

Fran Thibodeau asked what kind of equipment.

Supervisor Jenkins replied for inside the building.

Fran Thibodeau replied that it would be general fund.

Councilman Kusnierz said he thought the voters voted on a budget for the new building.

Harry Gutheil asked Supervisor Jenkins if he wanted to add \$100,000 to the general fund and Supervisor Jenkins replied no, he didn't want to do that. He said he misspoke on that one.

Councilman Kusnierz asked what kind of equipment.

Supervisor Jenkins said for example, a portable lift for the new building.

Councilman Kusnierz said that issue came up at a previous meeting and he thought the board voted on it.

The Town Clerk said she thought it was approved at the last meeting as a change order.

Councilman Cumm stated that it wasn't a change order and Supervisor Jenkins concurred. They said that they discussed it, but didn't act on it.

Fran Thibodeau stated that if it is a portable lift then it may be a highway fund item.

Supervisor Jenkins said it was questionable. If it is for inside the building then it may be general fund.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that he thought that Paul Joseph has a request list of equipment that we cut out of the budget. He said he would be more incline to support revenue for that versus a portable lift that we could get anytime.

Supervisor Jenkins said Paul was looking at a grader.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if it was a grader or gradall.

Councilman Prendergast cautioned them about jumping ahead and putting more money into this budget. They worked hard to cut things out so they could do what he just talked about and that is going easy on the taxpayers.

Councilman Kusnierz said he would be more inclined to support an equipment purchase if they were to postpone filling the vacant spot down there with personnel. That is the only way he would be amenable to it. They can't just plug in a figure without getting it from somewhere else.

Harry Gutheil asked about the Justice Court Personnel line item of the budget (A1110.1) and asked why it went from \$138,936.17 in 2010 to \$161,585.00 proposed for 2012. He asked if they added staff in the last two years.

Supervisor Jenkins said they added another part-time person.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Harry Gutheil asked about the Independent Auditing and Accounting line item in the budget (A1320.4). He said it went from \$20,000 the tentative budget figure to \$5,000 in the preliminary budget. He said that to his knowledge there hasn't been an audit in five years.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that the last audit was in 2007. The State Comptroller's Office is doing an audit now that he requested. That is why they cut the budget. NYS DEC requested an audit and they said either the State Comptroller or private and he went with the State Comptroller.

Adele Kurtz asked how much the 2% salary increases across the board costs the Town, non-contractually.

The answer to her question was not readily available at this meeting.

Adele Kurtz stated that the Governor agreed with some of the unions to freeze salaries for the next three years. While it won't be popular with the Town employees, even though it may only be \$20,000 this year it compounds over the years. There may be some savings the board could consider there. She said she has friends who work at the mill and every week they feel lucky that they are still working there at the end of the week. State employees haven't seen raises and it isn't uncommon for salaries to be frozen at this time.

Supervisor Jenkins said that in our position, our employees earn quite a bit less than people in the private sector. We are in a good financial position and a 2% increase doesn't come close to inflation. It is a little bit to help them out. It is important to have employees who are happy, because they work better. We are giving 2% to our Fire Company and everybody else wants 2% and not to take care of our employees, he doesn't agree with that.

Adele Kurtz asked what the non-union employees contribute towards health insurance.

Fran Thibodeau replied 5% and if a person was hired after 2006 then they contribute 20%.

Danny Shannon stated that the Corinth assessor makes \$19,000 a year and the Town of Moreau assessor makes \$40,000 a year. He asked what makes her worth so much.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that the Town of Moreau has about 6,000 parcels and Corinth has nowhere near that.

Councilman Cumm stated that he thought the Corinth assessor was part-time.

Danny Shannon stated that the taxes on his girlfriend's house have doubled. The assessor went and looked at the house and said she would get on it and when he went back to her she said she wasn't getting on it. He didn't think she was worth that much.

Supervisor Jenkins said he thought they had this discussion before and he was told there was no way it could be changed until next July. Once the taxes are posted at the county July 1st they can't be changed.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if she indicated a willingness to look at it.

Supervisor Jenkins said that she has been to the house and she feels that there is something that could be done about it, but it couldn't be done this year.

Danny Shannon stated that he was going to go through the grievance process, but the paperwork the assessor gave him was not the state paperwork that he would have filed. The paperwork she gave him was

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

very misleading. His property in Florida would have never been taxed at the rate that the Town charges for taxes and he grew up near Disney World where there are all kinds of jobs and everything else.

Supervisor Jenkins thanked him for his comments, but told Danny Shannon that they weren't going to talk about employees and this meeting was about the budget.

Harry Gutheil asked what the \$70,000 was for in the assessor's contractual line item (A1355.4).

Supervisor Jenkins said it was for a lot of miscellaneous things. We have about a half dozen Article 7's, but they are nowhere near that number. There is some anticipation for potential other costs, which have always been in there and we have to keep in there.

Councilman Cumm stated that figure came mainly from Martin concerning the estimated costs for legal services and miscellaneous things that would be required for those Article 7's.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that under the assessor's contractual, Martin had estimated \$30,000 for 2012 in legal fees.

Harry Gutheil asked about the attorney contractual line item in the budget (A1420.4). He asked why the drop from \$29,581.55 in 2010 to the preliminary budget figure of \$14,000.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that our legal expenses were down in 2011.

Adele Kurtz asked what has been spent year-to-date in this account.

Fran Thibodeau replied \$10,879.20.

Harry Gutheil asked if they budgeted for insurance for the new buildings.

Supervisor Jenkins replied no.

Harry Gutheil asked how the Town was going to insure them then.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that the highway garage will be done next year and the municipal center won't be done next year. Our insurance agent gave him the figures. There is always the contingency fund.

Harry Gutheil asked about the traffic control contractual line item (A3310.4) and why it went from \$24,278.62 in 2010 to the preliminary figure of \$33,000.00.

Supervisor Jenkins explained about the new signs that have to be purchased that the government is requiring.

Fran Thibodeau stated that the cost for striping the roads is paid from this account.

Adele Kurtz asked about the Control of Dogs contractual line item (A35210.4) that has a preliminary figure of \$16,000.00. She asked Fran what the total is that has been spent year-to-date.

Fran Thibodeau stated \$26,884.00. She stated that January 1st they had to put the DCO on the payroll. It was a budget amendment. We had to pay over-time to our former DCO.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that the money we pay the animal shelter per our agreement with them comes out of the contractual for dog control.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Harry Gutheil asked about the equipment line item for the superintendent of highways (A5010.2) that had a preliminary figure of \$5,400.

Supervisor Jenkins advised that this was for a phone system. Before the Town Board moves on purchasing a phone system, three quotes will have to be received.

Harry Gutheil said he would have to know a lot more about this before he would be budgeting \$5,400 for a phone system for the highway department. He said if the board really feels for the taxpayers then they should take a look at that. He asked if didn't they all have walkie-talkies and portable units.

Councilwoman LeClair stated that she thought they compared it to the system just purchased by the court.

Harry Gutheil asked about the records management line item and asked if we are still microfilming. He would hate to see us get too far behind. He said we made some great strides on records management.

The Town Clerk said if they did, it would have to be paid for by the Town. Grant money isn't available to microfilm, because we already received one grant to microfilm and the Town can't apply for the same grant twice.

Adele Kurtz asked what the economic assistance contractual (A6460.4) is for in the amount of \$15,000.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that he was applying for a \$15,000.00 grant from the county for signage and work in the industrial park. If we don't get the grant there won't be any expense.

Larry Bulman asked them to go back to the ambulance line item. He said he wanted to run through the numbers again. It gets back to the newspaper article discussed earlier. He asked the supervisor to breakdown the \$626,000 figure that is in the budget for the Moreau Emergency Squad.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that the \$626,000 is made up of \$231,000 and \$395,000 projected income. He said if they looked at the revenues they would see revenues in the amount of \$395,000 for emergency services. The actual cost is \$231,000. That is where the confusion came in over the newspaper article. Apparently the reporter didn't understand it.

Larry Bulman asked where the revenue is generated from.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that the \$395,000 is from insurance companies. The way it is required to be done under the law is that the Moreau EMS does the insurance billings, the money comes in from the insurance companies to the Moreau EMS and they in turn give the money to the Town and the Town then returns them to the squad. There is revenue and expense that we have to record. That part is a wash.

Steve VanGuilder stated that none of the payroll comes out of the \$231,000 at all. Taxpayer's dollars does not pay for salaries at all.

Larry Bulman stated that it gets back to what Councilman Kusnierz said, it is a shell game. He said he is for the squad having a paid department. He wished the Fire Department at least got a pension credit. He was a big proponent of that when he was on the board. He was a first responder at Finch Paper when he worked there. He was on their emergency response team. He knows that the squad members have to go through a lot of education and certification today that wasn't required years ago. He stated that Mrs. Kurtz brought up about the raises. Do we know what the emergency squad got for raises this year? We talked about 2% for the Town non-unionized employees. What did the squad get for raises?

Steve VanGuilder replied that they are not an agent of the Town. It says that right in the contract. As far as salaries, it is something they can't discuss.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Larry Bulman stated that as a taxpayer he is for them being paid, but he does care when some of his tax dollars are going towards the squad and they are accepting our money, he looks at them as a department. It is like some of the agencies that the State deals with, that are an arm of the State, for example, NYSERDA. He said that we had better believe that the Governor knows what NYSERDA is getting for raises and they aren't a State agency.

Steve VanGuilder replied that the contract they have with the Town states that they are not a division, agent or any arm of the Town. He said the supervisor could attest to this and Supervisor Jenkins replied it was true.

Councilman Prendergast told Steve VanGuilder that he has to understand where the rub comes from. This is a common theme throughout the Town. We have been through this before. It is a common theme throughout the Town, the questions raised here tonight. The reason they are being raised and the reason for the rub, you say you have nothing to do with the Town, but you accept our tax money. That tells us that you do have something to do with the Town.

Steve VanGuilder said it was like a garbage service coming in and wanting to do something down in Moreau Rec.

Councilman Prendergast said they would get the same questions. If you accept tax dollars you get questioned.

Steve VanGuilder asked Councilman Prendergast if he was going to know what the driver of the garbage truck gets paid per hour.

Councilman Prendergast stated that he wasn't convinced that by the end of this we won't know what you are getting paid.

Steve VanGuilder said he would be the first one to say how much he was getting paid. He said he was getting paid zero. He is a volunteer.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if that is what this is all about, how much somebody in this room is getting paid.

Councilman Prendergast said he wasn't saying that is what this is all about. He said he is the one asking the questions right now and he has the floor and he will tell them what it is all about.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that nobody was talking when he was speaking so he doesn't know who has the floor.

Councilman Prendergast said he and Steve VanGuilder were discussing this and it was quite obvious who had the floor.

Councilman Kusnierz said there was nobody talking when he started talking. He thought they had an equal role up here.

Councilman Prendergast said they can't talk at the same time.

Councilman Kusnierz replied that he wasn't.

Councilman Prendergast told Councilman Kusnierz that he still doesn't stop and he says he does.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilman Kusnierz said he wasn't going to allow Councilman Prendergast to walk all over him when he has an equal role up here.

Councilman Prendergast said yet he could interrupt him when he was holding a conversation with a member of the audience.

Councilman Kusnierz said he was commenting on what he said.

Councilman Prendergast said while he was discussing it with Steve VanGuilder.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if couldn't he discuss it with them.

Councilman Prendergast replied not if he has the floor.

Councilman Kusnierz said he didn't hear him recognized.

Councilman Prendergast stated "ridiculous".

Councilman Kusnierz came back with a statement that was inaudible on the audio of the meeting.

Larry Bulman stated that if they lived up to what they said and they come in and make a case to the Town Board, he doesn't care what the makeup is of the Town Board, and they tell the Town Board that they are going in this direction and, because they are going in this direction, they aren't going to ask for anymore added revenue down the road they are going to be able to live this number going forward, then he doesn't need to know what they make or what their raises are, but when they come back and ask for 5%, 10%, 3%, 2% over and above then we as taxpayers deserve to know where the monies are going. He runs a not-for-profit and he understands that if you get monies coming through a grant from the State, the AG and Comptroller can come in any time and look at all of the funds at any time and you have to answer their questions and you should be held accountable. His problem is when they said they were good with the \$195,000 or \$200,000 and if that is all they ever took and they were generating revenue, because of their good work then he wouldn't have a problem. He does have a problem and he feels he has a right to know when that number is going from \$200,000 to \$210,000 to \$220,000 to \$230,000 and climbing to \$300,000 when our Firefighters are equal to these people and they are not getting paid, because they don't have a funding source other than the municipality. They can't go to an insurance company like the squad can. He thanked everyone for taking his questions and hearing him tonight and he hopes the Town Board will look at that number.

Councilman Kusnierz told Larry Bulman that he was very happy and he totally agrees with him. That is why at budget time they require the Moreau Emergency Squad, the Fire Company and the Moreau Community Center to give them an accounting of how the money that the taxpayer's have provided to their entities is spent and they have that information. They have all the information where the money is going that goes down to the squad. We require the squad to give a monthly accounting of how that money is spent. We know how our taxpayer dollars are spent.

Larry Bulman stated that a lot of people contribute voluntarily outside of their tax dollars and a lot of people in the Town, including himself, feel that when they send them a check in the mail a lot of that money may go towards equipment and that may not be the case.

Steve VanGuilder said he could guarantee him that was the case. The checks come to him. He is the one that opens every single piece of mail that comes unless it is addressed to a particular member. He is the only one who empties the mailbox. He stated that Supervisor Jenkins just did an audit and he asked him what he found out. He asked Supervisor Jenkins if he found any problems.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins replied not with the information he was provided.

Steve VanGuilder said he doesn't hide anything. He said the problem is that there was a lot of animosity. There were people there that ran it, not the right way. He runs it as clear as day as he can. He said if there are any questions they should be brought to him. He said no one should hesitate to call him. He said that nobody calls him with questions. He has to hear it out in the Town. He doesn't even in live in the Town. He asked why Councilman Cumm or Councilman Prendergast or Larry Bulman can't call him with questions. He invited the Town down to EMS week and not one board member showed up. He went to the Fire Convention Open House and one board member attended. He didn't even get that down at his emergency squad.

Nick Smith asked Supervisor Jenkins if he did an audit of the Moreau EMS records.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that he did a partial audit. He looked at the checking information, copies of expense records, check stubs and he didn't find any problems. They asked multiple questions about internal control issues. The only thing he saw that he questioned was the loan situation that they had at that time and it has increased since that time. He would say as a financial person, he would have some concerns. He wasn't privy to information on the paid people. The only thing we ever see of that is the income that comes in.

Nick Smith asked if that entity is tax payer dollars.

Supervisor Jenkins replied basically that is what that account is for, yes

Nick Smith asked if he found any issues with the taxpayer dollars portion of the audit.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that because of the way they listed them he didn't find any problems. He wouldn't say that he agrees totally with the concept that he was talking about.

Nick Smith asked Supervisor Jenkins if he found any issues with the amount of money that comes in from the Town from taxpayer's dollars that the Town audits every single month.

Supervisor Jenkins replied no.

Councilman Prendergast stated that the taxpayer's are the ones who are concerned. The reason they are concerned is exactly what was brought up here tonight. The squad changed their operation from volunteer to paid, not that the board had a big choice, because the squad decided they were going to do this. The problem becomes that year after year the squad keeps coming in asking for more and more money and yet they are billing insurance companies. That is where the rub comes in. He has heard it from people they work for. He heard it two days ago and that was the whole conversation. He told Steve VanGuilder that he is bringing their concerns to him. When they changed things he figured there would be some run time. They had to start the operation, get a feel for the operation, there was money coming that they didn't have before and how to handle that. What he sees here is a pattern. He said the taxpayer isn't benefitting from this, because every year the board hears they need more and more. The people he works for come to him and he is bringing their concerns to him. He told Steve VanGuilder that he needs to have the answers.

Steve VanGuilder told Councilman Prendergast that he hasn't received one phone call from him

Councilman Prendergast stated that he wouldn't get a call from him. He wants to do it in the open, in public. He even wants the newspaper here. He doesn't want to do it on the phone. He wants to do it in the open so there is transparency. It is the public that grabbed me two days ago. It wasn't the first time and it won't be the last. They ask me how "they" can keep coming back. They are getting insurance

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

money and they keep asking for more of our money. I don't have an answer for them. He said that when they started the paid program he figured there would be some run time, big changes. He said they have had their run time. He is sure that next year they will be in asking for a percentage increase. How much he doesn't know. He is sure they will back again the year after next. The taxpayer's aren't getting the benefit of this that he thought they would get.

Steve VanGuilder stated that what people don't understand is that the insurance money is separate from the volunteer money and they aren't ever comingled.

Councilman Prendergast said that he never said the money was comingled. It is how it is managed. The cost of any business is how it is managed. He told Steve VanGuilder that the other part of the operation and how it is run does affect how much they ask for from the people out there. Transparency is what he is talking about. He said if they want to get rid of all the allegations, accusations, comments and everything that is out there and there is a lot then they need transparency. That is why he wants to do this in public too, transparency.

Steve VanGuilder said he wasn't trying to hide anything. He told Councilman Prendergast to call him.

Councilman Prendergast said "show everything". He said his life is like this, you want to accuse me of something I'll show you and prove to you I didn't do it. I hate being accused of something I didn't do. It drives me nuts. I rarely get angry, you want to see me angry, accuse me of something I didn't do. You want to see me angry? Do that. He said "you" should be the same way, come in I'll show you that you are wrong I'll prove it to you.

Steve VanGuilder said that Supervisor Jenkins has been down.

Councilman Prendergast told Steve VanGuilder that he knows the information they are asking for. It is the only way they were going to stop it out there.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that this board signs a contract with the squad every year. Last year there was a little bit of a delay and a few problems, but they got worked out. This board agreed and he thought it was unanimous or maybe it was 4 to 1 he couldn't remember, that one of the things we didn't need to see was salaries. It is in the contract. He said, to sit up here and make accusatory statements that somebody is not providing something, when this board agreed that we didn't have to see that. If it was so important, it should have been in the contract.

Councilwoman LeClair stated that she voted against the contract last year, because she felt they should see it all.

Councilman Kusnierz said he was on the board when the squad came to the Town and wanted to have a paid service. He didn't know how it would work or anything about it, but one of the things he mistakenly thought was that if they did third party billings then the insurance money would pay for everything and it wouldn't cost taxpayers anything. It was made crystal clear at every single meeting that would never be the case, because those monies would be utilized for separate purposes, for advanced care for personnel down there. He said it is in the minutes. He said some of the members of the Town Board were here then and some weren't. He said he doesn't understand why this argument keeps coming up. He doesn't know whether it is politically motivated or whether the people out there don't understand what happened back then, but it is all there. He said maybe somebody has to do a better job of how everything came to be. Do a history of what happened with the squad, how you got to where you are today and put it on your website and then our community will understand it better. Every budget time it is a rehash of the same issue.

Steve VanGuilder said that they have a website full of Q & A's (Questions and Answers). He told the board members again to call him. He would meet with them. He said that is where the animosity starts, this

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

one said this and that one said that.

Larry Bulman asked Councilman Kusnierz whose was being paid at the squad. What position is Steve VanGuilder in at the squad?

Steve VanGuilder replied that his is the President of the squad.

Larry Bulman stated that if Steve VanGuilder is the President and he doesn't get paid, then who gets paid?

Councilman Kusnierz said he would imagine the professional service providers.

Larry Bulman asked how many there were and Councilman Kusnierz said he didn't know.

Steve VanGuilder replied there are 30, but they aren't paid all at one time. They do twelve hour shifts, 6 pm to 6 am. He is a volunteer and has a full-time job from 8 am to 5 pm, Monday through Friday, so he isn't able to be at the squad during the daytime so they have to pay somebody to be there. All the volunteers work during the day. He explained that they prepare the work schedule for December by the 20th of November. He said that he and Nick Smith, being volunteers, put their work schedule in. Then the paid staff puts in their schedule.

Larry Bulman stated that he hasn't picked up the phone and called the squad, because he agrees with Councilman Prendergast and he wants to do it in public. If he picks up the phone and calls someone then it gets misconstrued that Larry Bulman doesn't support the EMS and that is the farthest from the truth, because he does support the EMS. He tried to be successful in getting the firemen compensation for pension purposes for the great job they do as well. However, when he goes on-line and views the 990 and he sees salaries of \$440,000 and he goes back and sees budgets of \$627,000 and he does the math, then he assumes that at least a portion of what we are paying as taxpayers or what people are dropping in the basket or checks that people are mailing in have to be going towards salaries.

Steve VanGuilder replied not at all.

Councilman Cumm stated that this is a simple situation here. They have two budgets. He said for simplicity sake they have a \$600,000 budget. \$400,000 is from insurance money and \$200,000 is Town money. If the squad was doing a better job, and he doesn't even care about the salaries at this point, managing the insurance money then the Town portion could be lowered. It looks obvious to him that the insurance money isn't being managed properly. Therefore, the Town has to pick up the difference. He said some of the insurance money could be used for some of the expenses that the Town is paying for. If that money was managed better, then our Town portion could be lowered. That is where he is coming from.

Nick Smith asked Councilman Cumm what would happen if people stopped using their services, say there was a lull year, and there wasn't enough money coming in contractually for the squad to cover their bills.

Councilman Cumm replied that the squad would have to do some fundraising and cut back on expenses that don't need to be paid for.

Steve VanGuilder replied that they have tried fundraising, but it is 2011. When he first joined the squad in 1995 they had no problems doing fundraisers. They made "stupid" money. Now if he holds a carwash or any fundraiser, such as, a chicken barbeque only eight people show up to help. He said if a carwash is held only three people show up to help.

Councilman Cumm told Steve VanGuilder that he needs to do a better job with managing the insurance money too.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Andre Delvaux advised that they have also doubled their staff from the time when they started their paid program. They added on EMT's to supplement the volunteers and they hired a full-time and a part-time billing person in-house. So in essence they doubled their payroll.

Councilman Cumm stated that on their schedule for November 2011 there is a billing specialist that is on from 6 am to 6 am, an EMT or higher that is on from 6 am to 6 am and a driver that is on from 6 am to 6 pm. He said he wouldn't mention names, because there are a lot of names on the sheet. He asked what this means. He asked if the billing specialist is paid and Andre replied yes. Councilman Cumm said it reads that the billing specialist is on from 6 am to 6 am. That billing specialist is down on the schedule for 6 am to 6 am every day of the week except Saturday.

Steve VanGuilder stated that Councilman Cumm needed to be educated on how to read the schedule. It is the way the program works. He asked if there was a name there.

Councilman Kusnierz said it is a controlled field. They put a name in there if somebody is going to work. If there is no name there then nobody is working.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if there isn't any name, then there isn't anybody working. She referred to the position of observer and there is no name listed then that means that nobody is working.

Councilman Cumm asked if they have coverage 24 hours a day seven days a week.

Steven VanGuilder said there are three ambulances covered 24/7 - 365 days a year.

Andre Delvaux stated that those are the people in the station.

Nick Smith stated that it doesn't mean that staff for three ambulances get paid 24/7. It means that there is one paid paramedic or a paid EMT that gets paid for one shift whether it is 6 pm to 6 am or 6 am to 6 pm. There is also a volunteer that works alongside that paid member or possibly two paid members depending on the volunteers scheduled. After that, other ambulances are staffed by volunteers who come in the middle of the night from their homes to help whoever it is that needs the service.

Councilwoman LeClair asked again if she looks at the slot on the scheduled labeled driver or higher and there isn't any name there then that means that position isn't staffed.

Nick Smith said that is correct.

Steve VanGuilder said it could be under EMT.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if she looked under EMT and there isn't any name there then that means it is not staffed.

Steve VanGuilder said they would always see two people in that slot.

Andre Delvaux said that there are different fields that they can add people's names to.

Nick Smith said on the computer program there is a drop down box and they have to click on a name. If they don't click on a name then it will say billing specialist instead of somebody's name.

Councilwoman LeClair said again that there isn't anybody working if there isn't a name there.

Nick Smith said there isn't anybody working in that specific field, but there may be two names above it or below it.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilwoman LeClair asked if they would be doing different jobs.

Nick Smith said whatever their job is.

Steve VanGuilder reviewed the schedule that Councilwoman LeClair had and explained how it worked.

Councilman Kusnierz said the figure in the budget is \$626,000. \$231,000 of it is taxpayer's dollars. He asked the board if they wanted to change the figure up, down or leave it the same so they could move on. They have a whole budget to go through. They will have a public hearing on the contract. He said he is fine with the 2% that is in the budget.

Councilwoman LeClair said she is at the same spot she was last year until she knows how every dollar is spent.

Councilman Kusnierz asked Councilwoman LeClair what number she wants to see in the budget. He told her to give them a number. He asked if she wanted it to be \$100,000.

Councilwoman LeClair said she wants to see how the money is spent and until that she doesn't want to see a number in the there. She gave a proposal last year.

Larry Bulman asked the Town Board to go back and look at the minutes. A deal is a deal. They knew they were going to paid status, but it works both ways. When the squad tells the board, who are elected to represent the people, that they will be able to hold it at \$195,000 and that is what the minutes say then that is where it should be.

Harry Gutheil asked about the Historical Society line item in the budget and why it was decreased.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that two years ago they had to have a roof replaced so the board gave them a little increase to help them with that. We brought it back down to where it was before.

Nick Smith asked how many contracts the Town has with people or organizations or companies.

Supervisor Jenkins replied three organizations that we sign contracts with that the Town funds. The other contracts that they sign are with youth programs, contractors, engineers, architects.

Nick Smith asked if the board requires all of their companies and employees to submit their salaries to the board for every single contract that the board has with other companies, organizations, building contractors, youth program people who rent Town facilities.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that most of their contracts, if they are major contracts like with the water project that is based on the pipe that goes in the ground and all the issues that go with, so that contract gets modified as things change in the process, so there is fiscal accountability. If it is a public service contract then they have to be paid the federal wages.

Nick Smith asked if all laborers are broken down and how much they make.

Supervisor Jenkins said that in the case of engineers or architects or attorneys, we have a contract that establishes their rate of pay and they report their hourly work to us in detail.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that there are instances when we have contracts for just a total amount.

Nick Smith asked if it is fair to ask one and not the other.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins said he could explain a slight difference to him, but “you people” never agreed with this statement and you won’t agree with it now. Your paid service uses the vehicles that we pay for and you use the building we pay for and the insurance that we pay for covers you. There are many things that are paid out of Town money that assist the paid people in operating it. He doesn’t have a problem with this, but nobody has ever understood that as a fact. If we didn’t give you the money to pay for the ambulances or the building then you wouldn’t have vehicles to drive or a building to be in. He said they tend to think that doesn’t matter. He said they have had this conversation before, but they need to move on with the budget.

Councilwoman LeClair said she wanted to say one thing. The Moreau Emergency Squad is the only entity that she has had anyone from the public question her at all on and they have questioned her repeatedly. She referred to a piece of paper in her hand and said it was dropped anonymously at her door today. She had a phone call and she talked to a gentleman who questioned her tonight before she came to the meeting. She is accountable to the taxpayers and that is why she is requesting those items that she requested from the squad. If they asked for these items from another entity then she would ask for them also.

Harry Gutheil asked about the Health Insurance.

Fran Thibodeau explained how the estimated increase for health insurance was at 20% initially and then it came in at 21% and then the Town got another offer at 6% and that is the offer the Town is going with. The budget still shows the 21% increase in health insurance, because we still have to pay an HRA. Also, one employee who was receiving an insurance buy-out is now going to take the insurance coverage. A highway employee retiree is requesting a family plan now.

Supervisor Jenkins advised that the highway department agreed last week to change their insurance.

Harry Gutheil stated that if they wanted to help the general fund out they shouldn’t charge 2% interest to the industrial park for the loan. The Town is only earning probably about ¼ of 1% or less on its investments. If they adjusted that figure then the Town wouldn’t be looked at as arbitrage (making interest on interest).

Harry Gutheil looked at the Interest and Penalties Revenues on page 10 of the budget and noticed it jumped up a lot and that is a real big indicator of how our community is doing financially. He said if they anticipated the interest and penalties to go up that much then that means our constituents are struggling out there.

The Town Clerk advised that they should lower that amount back down to \$16,000 from the \$21,000 that was in the preliminary budget. She apologized for the error. She didn’t notice in the Town Clerk’s software program that there was the lump sum payment of penalties from the School District posted and that amount was already reported in the software program in the daily collections of penalties so the total penalties for the year were actually \$5,000 less than what she put in her budget for revenues.

Harry Gutheil asked where they were at with fines and forfeitures. The tentative budget showed \$160,000 and the preliminary at \$190,000.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that when he did his calculations he was missing one month’s worth of fines due to a late filing. When the board met with the court it was decided that we should be able to hit the \$190,000 mark.

Harry Gutheil asked how they are doing with the mortgage tax.

Fran Thibodeau stated that is has been down this year.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins said there are a couple projects being started this year in the Town that should bring in some mortgage revenue.

Harry Gutheil asked if we are receiving reimbursements from the State for the reval.

Supervisor Jenkins said he would have to check on this for him.

Adele Kurtz asked if the Town anticipates receiving anything from the State for the STAR Program Aid (A3040).

Supervisor Jenkins replied that they are looking at a 2% cut.

Adele Kurtz noted that the budget doesn't show the Town receiving anything in 2009 or 2010, but it shows \$24,000 anticipated for 2012.

Fran Thibodeau stated that \$23,979 has been received to-date in A3040 STAR Program Aid. She did receive a note from Peggy Jenkins, Assessor. She would have to read again.

Harry Gutheil wondered if the reval aid was put in that account.

Councilman Kusnierz said that could be.

Harry Gutheil asked why the mobile home park fees are down from 2010 (B2770).

There was no real answer given to his question.

Harry Gutheil asked what was being done for the highway department, miles of roads, equipment purchases, etc.

Councilman Cumm stated that they planned to do the following in 2012:

Grinding		
Hatchery Road	.71 miles	\$27,241.20
Old West Road	1.03 miles	\$38,794.56
Total Cost for Grinding		\$66,035.76

Nova Chipping		
Mott Road	2,700 feet	\$36,630.00
Thornapple Drive	2,800 feet	\$37,990.00
Total Cost for Nova Chipping		\$74,620.00

Blacktop		
Hatchery Road	3,700 feet	\$108,500.00
Old West Road	5,500 feet	\$161,000.00
Total Cost for Blacktop		\$269,500.00
Overlays		
Fawn Road	\$47,600.00	\$47,600.00

Harry Gutheil said the Town has about 80 to 90 miles of roads and if we don't have a ten, twelve or fifteen year plan and if we don't do enough then we will get behind.

Councilman Cumm stated that the Town is behind and has been behind for years. We were behind in

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

2008. He advised how they ended up eliminating from the Highway Superintendent's request list the following: Reservoir Road, Wynnefield Drive, Jacobie Road and Jennifer Lane. He said they are behind about five years in paving.

Harry Gutheil asked what they would do when the roads get bad.

Councilman Prendergast said they would have to raise the money.

Harry Gutheil asked about equipment.

Councilman Prendergast said they are going to purchase some, but they have to prioritize. You can have a plan, but you need the funds.

Councilman Cumm said they eliminated from the request list a loader for \$140,000 and a used gradall for \$68,000 and a used buck truck for \$22,000.

Councilman Kusnierz said it would be easier to say what they are purchasing, which he stated as follows: A four year lease on a 2011 Tractor (second year out of four year lease) and a five year lease on a tandem truck.

Councilman Cumm stated that they weren't planning on leasing any equipment.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that the figures in the budget are leases from last year.

Councilman Kusnierz said they have to be paid every year.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that the plan was to purchase the following:

Small dump truck for \$89,000 with sander, body and plow
4X4 Pickup Truck with a plow for \$38,960

Harry Gutheil asked if the pickup would be for the highway superintendent and the answer was yes.

Harry Gutheil asked how many miles were on the other pickup and how old was it.

Supervisor Jenkins said there are two trucks. The one they aren't sure if it will pass inspection again or not.

Harry Gutheil asked how we are doing with our big trucks.

Councilman Cumm advised that we have a 2002 950 CAT loader that needs \$5,400.00 worth of repairs right now that the board has to talk about tonight. The engines injectors went. He said there are very few pieces of equipment that we own that are less than fifteen years old.

Harry Gutheil stated that we need to make sure we have enough plow trucks. The public will notice when the roads aren't plowed.

Supervisor Jenkins advised that there are two gradalls for sale that are about 10 years old that are off lease from the State of New York and we can purchase one for \$68,000 by trading in our gradall. That along with the used bucket truck for \$22,000 we could purchase this year. We have received about \$100,000 more in sales tax money than what was anticipated.

Harry Gutheil asked how many hours they put on the gradall in a year.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilman Kusnierz said it is the main piece of equipment that they use down there.

Supervisor Jenkins said they could use the sales tax money for this and it wouldn't have any impact on taxes.

Harry Gutheil stated that there is also a tax stabilization reserve fund that has about \$100,000 in it.

Fran Thibodeau noted that there is also an equipment reserve fund.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that they were putting \$50,000 into that fund.

Councilman Kusnierz said originally they agreed that they would use the equipment reserve fund for the future purchase of a tandem truck.

Councilman Cumm stated that Truck 14 is so rusted that you can put your fist right up through the frame.

Harry Gutheil asked if the board had looked into contracting with a contractor who has a truck that has a wing plow and that may need work in the winter.

The board members replied something to the effect, that they hadn't done this.

Harry Gutheil asked about the snow removal line item and why it was increased almost 90% since 2010.

Fran Thibodeau advised that they split the gas for the trucks between two accounts and a lot of it is diesel fuel. She said plus road salt.

Adele Kurtz asked what the year-to-date figure is for DB5142.4 Snow Removal.

Fran Thibodeau replied \$411,362 including payroll.

Nick Smith asked how many vehicles the highway department has. He was wondering why we would spend so much money on a new highway building when we don't have vehicles that are functioning to put in it.

Councilman Cumm stated that we could use that money for a capital improvement project that benefits the Town, but we couldn't use it to purchase equipment.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that we have a lot of equipment that is outside and not protected and with the new facility and existing facility the equipment will be protected.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if we could get another year out of the gradall.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that Paul Joseph thinks it is a good time to get a deal on one and he was talking about the used one that is off lease from the State of New York.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that he was for purchasing a used gradall this year, if they move the \$38,960 that is in the budget for the Highway Superintendent's truck and hold off purchasing that for one year. That would cover one half of the cost of the used gradall with trade and he would like to see them hold off filling the vacancy in the highway department and put the \$100,000 into the equipment reserve fund so they have a good jump on a new tandem.

Councilman Cumm stated that the problem with eliminating the hiring of a person for the highway department is that would cut us down by one plow crew and lengthen the plow routes by 45 minutes to

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

one hour, so he has been told.

Councilman Kusnierz said he wasn't proposing to eliminate the position of laborer rather just not fill it right away.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that historically there have been issues with staffing in the highway department for a variety of reasons and we didn't have a full contingent of highway employees and the job got done. Things have improved down there with staffing and less absenteeism down there. This is one way in these tough times to get something that is probably a primary item that highway uses for a majority of the year with a little bit of pain maybe extending a plow route for a season. It all hinges on how many snow storms we have. It could mean an extra 10 hours or 40 hours.

Supervisor Jenkins asked if he was saying not to fill the vacancy in the highway department.

Councilman Kusnierz said temporarily.

Councilman Prendergast stated that he has seen problems and expressed problems after winter storms, here at meetings, because they have problems with plow routes.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that keeping our roads clean is a public safety issue.

Nick Smith asked if this could be a seasonal position.

Councilman Cumm replied that we have problems getting wing people.

Danny Shannon stated that he has viewed roads being plowed by regular 4X4 pickup trucks in Saratoga Springs.

Councilman Cumm stated that is because their streets are narrow. We need standard plow trucks with a wing, because we have roads that are a lot wider.

Larry Bulman asked if he heard correctly at the beginning of the meeting that a house with a \$200,000 assessment would have a \$6.00 increase in taxes per year. The answer was yes.

Larry Bulman said he wants to keep our roads safe. He said they have to remember that the Village has its own DPW. This is a Town outside tax for Town highways and rural roads.

Councilman Kusnierz said we don't have a highway tax.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that right now the highway budget is \$118,000 less than last year's right now. He said we are in a position where we can make some of these moves.

Harry Gutheil asked where they were at with the fund balance in the DB account

Fran Thibodeau replied that it is at about \$900,000 now.

Councilwoman LeClair said she would like to speak with Paul Joseph before she makes a decision since he is the one who runs the highway department.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that the only concern he has is does he really need that second truck. What he heard before is that at times they have had to take a big truck, because they have nothing else to drive.

Councilwoman LeClair said she would like his opinion.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Councilman Prendergast and Councilman Cumm said Paul Joseph had this as the second most important item on his priority list.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that he would like to add \$68,000 for a used gradall and put \$50,000 into the equipment reserve fund for the highway department and the \$50,000 would come from fund balance.

Brief discussion followed between a couple of the board members and Chris Abrams a laborer with the highway department.

Brief discussion followed between the Supervisor and Harry Gutheil about sales tax and the County Board of Supervisors.

Fran Thibodeau asked if the board wanted to add \$68,000 for a gradall and the answer was yes.

Supervisor Jenkins told Fran that they wanted to raise the highway equipment reserve fund to \$100,000 also.

Harry Gutheil asked about the \$181,800 appropriation for the Recreation Capital Project Fund that was listed on the first page of the budget.

Supervisor Jenkins advised that was just a memo entry. We can't establish a budget for a capital project until there is an actual project.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that they didn't need money in the budget for the ice rink at the rec. park if it is going to be purchased through the school grant. He was told that money wasn't budgeted for an ice rink.

Adele Kurtz asked if money was budgeted for a community garden.

Councilwoman LeClair replied that the Moreau Community Center has included a request for funding for a children's community garden from the school grant. The adult portion of the community garden will be discussed at the next meeting at the Moreau Community Center of November 22.

Councilman Kusnierz asked about the gradall.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that they were going to add \$50,000 to the highway equipment reserve fund. The used gradall that we can purchase is \$68,000 with a trade-in.

Councilman Cumm asked Chris Abrams about the gradall the highway has now and Chris said there are a lot of issues with it.

Councilman Prendergast stated that there is \$50,000 in the highway equipment reserve fund and the plan is to add another \$50,000 to make a total of \$100,000.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that there is \$1,450,000 budgeted from sales tax revenues. The projection is that we will receive \$2.6 million this year and the projection next year is that we will receive a little more than the \$2.6 million. He stated that there is \$150,000 in sales tax revenues that they can apply towards the purchase of a pickup truck and still end up with a surplus in the Town Outside Village fund.

Councilman Kusnierz asked if they really need to purchase a pickup truck that badly.

Supervisor Jenkins stated it was the second priority on the highway superintendent's list and the first priority was a dump truck.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Harry Gutheil referred to the special districts and noted that there was a surplus budgeted in the amount of \$30,000 in the sewer district and that there were surpluses in quite a few of the districts and in Water District 2 it appears that there is a fund balance of close to one half of a million dollars. He also noted that they were budgeting revenues over expenses by almost 50% of the total cost of the districts. He said it was time to reduce rates or create a reserve fund or pay off the debt to Queensbury.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that these are all special districts and there are only a couple of districts that can pay off Queensbury. He said he was trying to get clarification as to whether or not we can have loans between the special districts that don't have to be paid off by the end of the year.

Harry Gutheil stated that they could do a BAN for five years. He said they could save a minimum of \$500 per month.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that it could be a possibility, but he doesn't know what the implications would be.

Councilman Cumm stated that after Harry Gutheil mentioned this at a previous meeting, he discussed it with Supervisor Jenkins and Councilman Cumm agreed that we should pay off Queensbury and get rid of that bill.

Harry Gutheil stated that they have been doing the same thing that has been done for the past fifteen years. They haven't been criticized for this, but maybe they will be now that an audit is being done. They are loaning the money from the landfill to pay off the industrial park and they have been paying on that for the past 15 years.

Supervisor Jenkins stated the only question is if they can do it legally.

Harry Gutheil stated that the loan to the industrial park was originally by a BAN. They could convert it to an inter-fund loan. If they get criticized then take the heat, they would be saving the Town a lot of money.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that he wasn't sure it would be considered an inter-fund loan because the industrial park is technically not a fund of the Town.

Harry Gutheil asked what the balance was on the loan and Councilman Kusnierz replied \$187,000 as of August.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that in general, as far as setting up reserves in those special districts, right now they are leaving it in the general fund, because they have to take a look at whether or not they are going to merge the districts.

Harry Gutheil said he is totally opposed to that. That is the share of the wealth philosophy. It is totally unfair to the people who have paid their debt and to take their money and pay somebody else's debt. The idea of it totally irritates him. He said wait until the people in Water District 2 find out they have about \$700,000 in fund balance and you are going to add another \$60,000 to it this year according to the budget and you are going to tell them you are going to take some of that money to pay off another districts debt. He said it is unconscionable. Then tell him that he has to pay \$3,000 plus for a water tap in a district that has that kind of money.

Harry Gutheil stated that Water District is headed for trouble and it would have been in trouble before now if it hasn't been living off borrowed money, which he said isn't right.

Harry Gutheil asked what account the salt shed was being paid out of.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Supervisor Jenkins replied the capital project fund.

Harry Gutheil said the people voted on a building not a salt shed.

Supervisor Jenkins suggested that he read the proposition.

Councilman Cumm read from the proposition, "any buildings, equipment in and any ancillary buildings thereon.

Harry Gutheil asked how much the salt shed was costing.

Councilman Cumm replied that it was estimated at \$150,000 to \$160,000 and it came in at \$60,000 or thereabouts.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that was because we changed the design of it.

Councilman Prendergast stated that the salt shed we are replacing went from poor shape to bad shape and it was ready to fall down.

Harry Gutheil said he realized it was in bad shape.

Harry Gutheil asked why they were showing depreciation for the Transfer Station in the budget.

Fran Thibodeau said it becomes an actual at the year-end closing.

Harry Gutheil said they aren't budgeting it then and the answer was no.

Supervisor Jenkins stated that the Transfer Station is headed for serious problems. More than likely we may cut down on days of service there.

Harry Gutheil asked if they knew why it was in trouble.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that less people are using Transfer Stations county-wide. The same reason the county is having trouble with their recycling centers, because of the way the rubbish collectors are picking up rubbish and recyclables. It is all mixed now.

Councilman Cumm stated that Washington County came and looked at our operation and wanted to know how we kept our Transfer Station going, because everyone of their Transfer Stations are losing money. They were told that we are having trouble keeping ours going too and may have to cut back on the days of service.

Supervisor Jenkins advised that one employee in the Transfer Station took health insurance benefits recently.

Harry Gutheil stated that every time the rates are raised we lose customers. Since he has left office he hasn't been able to afford to use our own Transfer Station and he said that is a shame. If we charged by weight it would be a fairer way to charge.

Councilman Prendergast stated that he pays more by car than someone would with a truck over time. The old way of charging he paid more for one bag per trip than someone with a pickup truck did for one trip into the Transfer Station simply because he had a car and not a pickup truck.

Councilman Cumm stated that we have the lowest rates in Saratoga County.

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

Harry Gutheil noted that the projected revenues dropped \$30,000 from 2010.

Councilman Cumm stated that if our Transfer Station was the only one in Saratoga County that was in trouble then he could see how a case could be easily made that there was a problem here, but when all Transfer Stations are having trouble then it sends a different message.

Harry Gutheil said there used to be a fund balance.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that we still do.

Harry Gutheil asked what the fund balance is now.

Fran Thibodeau replied \$71,000 through the end of August.

Harry Gutheil said it doesn't sound like it is in trouble that way.

Supervisor Jenkins replied that it will go down again this year and at some point we will have to replace some equipment down there and it will be at a significant cost.

Councilman Cumm stated that the frontend loader at the Transfer Station is falling apart.

Supervisor Jenkins he was more worried about the compactor issue.

Councilman Cumm replied the compactor was just purchased in 2007 and is only \$40,000 to replace. The frontend loader takes a beating.

Harry Gutheil said he could see that it is headed for trouble.

Supervisor Jenkins said he realizes that and that is why they are looking at it. He said that one employee at the Transfer Station is retiring in March supposedly. Rather than replace we may go to part-time and have one full-time working in other departments too. We may go to stickers on bags here rather than have to pay at the Transfer Station. We may be cutting service there.

Supervisor Jenkins asked for a motion and second to close the Public Hearing.

A motion was made by Councilman Cumm and seconded by Councilwoman LeClair to close the Public Hearing at 9:55 p.m.

Roll call vote resulted as follows:

Councilman Cumm	Yes
Councilman Prendergast	Yes
Councilwoman LeClair	Yes
Councilman Kusnierz	Yes

Councilman Kusnierz then stated that if they close the Public Hearing then there can be no changes to the budget. He asked if they wanted to keep it open.

It was decided by the board to keep the Public Hearing open.

Councilman Cumm rescinded his motion to close the Public Hearing.

The Town Clerk asked if they were going to set a date to continue the Public Hearing or was the board

A Public Hearing on the 2012 Preliminary Town Budget was held by the Town Board of the Town of Moreau on November 10, 2011 in the Town of Moreau Office Building, 61 Hudson Street, South Glens Falls, New York.

going to set it in the special meeting that was scheduled to follow this Public Hearing.

Councilman Cumm asked what they were going to do about the Moreau Emergency Squad, do they want to hold a special meeting about the Moreau Emergency Squad. He asked if they could hold a special meeting on the squad and vote on the budget at the same meeting and if they could hold the meeting next week.

Councilman Kusnierz stated that the Public Hearing is open so all they had to do is close it.

Councilman Cumm said they could re-open it next week and vote on the budget and the Moreau Emergency Squad.

Councilman Kusnierz said they didn't want to close the Public Hearing until they took care of the Moreau Emergency Squad.

Councilman Cumm stated that they could take care of the Moreau Emergency Squad, make whatever changes they needed to and then close the Public Hearing and then vote.

Councilman Kusnierz said this was right.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeanne Fleury
Town Clerk